

Published by Faculty of Sciences and Mathematics, University of Niš, Serbia Available at: http://www.pmf.ni.ac.rs/filomat

# On a Conjecture of the Harmonic Index and the Minimum Degree of Graphs

Xiaoling Sun<sup>a,b</sup>, Yubin Gao<sup>a</sup>, Jianwei Du<sup>a</sup>, Lan Xu<sup>a</sup>

 $^a$ School of Science, North University of China, Taiyuan, 030051, P. R. China  $^b$ School of Instrument and Electronics, North University of China, Taiyuan, 030051, P. R. China

**Abstract.** The harmonic index of a graph G is defined as the sum of the weights  $\frac{2}{d(u)+d(v)}$  of all edges uv of G, where d(u) denotes the degree of the vertex u in G. Cheng and Wang [4] proposed a conjecture: For all connected graphs G with  $n \geq 4$  vertices and minimum degree  $\delta(G) \geq k$ , where  $1 \leq k \leq \lfloor \frac{n}{2} \rfloor + 1$ , then  $H(G) \geq H(K_{k,n-k}^*)$  with equality if and only if  $G \cong K_{k,n-k}^*$ .  $K_{k,n-k}^*$  is a complete split graph which has only two degrees, i.e. degree k and degree k = 1, and the number of vertices of degree k = 1 is k = 1. In this work, we prove that this conjecture is true when  $k \leq \frac{n}{2}$ , and give a counterexample to show that the conjecture is not correct when  $k = \lfloor \frac{n}{2} \rfloor + 1$ , k = 1 is even, that is  $k = \frac{n}{2} + 1$ .

## 1. Introduction

Throughout this paper we consider only simple connected graphs. Such a graph will be denoted by G = (V(G), E(G)), where V(G) and E(G) are the vertex set and edge set of G, respectively. For a vertex v of a graph G, we denote the degree of v by  $d_G(v)$  (d(v) for short). The minimum degree of G is denoted by  $\delta(G)$ . We use G - uv to denote the graph that arises from G by deleting the edge  $uv \in E(G)$ . Let G(n,k) be the set of connected simple graphs of order n with minimum degree k. We use  $K_{k,n-k}^*$  to denote the graph that arises from the complete bipartite graph  $K_{k,n-k}$  by joining every pair of vertices in the partite set with k vertices by a new edge. Our other notations are standard and taken mainly from [2].

The Randić index R(G), proposed by Randić [11] in 1975, is defined as the sum of the weights  $\frac{1}{\sqrt{d(u)d(v)}}$  over all edges uv of G, that is,

$$R(G) = \sum_{uv \in E(G)} \frac{1}{\sqrt{d(u)d(v)}}.$$

The Randić index is one of the most successful molecular descriptors in structure-property and structure-activity relationship studies. Mathematical properties of this descriptor have been studied extensively (see [7-9] and the references cited therein).

2010 Mathematics Subject Classification. Primary 05C07; Secondary 05C90

Keywords. harmonic index, minimum degree

Received: 07 September 2017; Accepted: 27 August 2018

Communicated by Francesco Belardo

Research supported by the Shanxi Natural Science Foundation (No. 201601D202003) and the Foundation of North University of China (No. 20131201)

Email address: sunxiaoling@nuc.edu.cn (Xiaoling Sun)

Another variant of the Randić index is called the harmonic index. For a graph G, the harmonic index H(G) is defined in [6] as

$$H(G) = \sum_{uv \in E(G)} \frac{2}{d(u) + d(v)}.$$

Zhong [13] determined the minimum and maximum values of the harmonic index for simple connected graphs and trees. Wu et al. [12] determined the graph with minimum harmonic index among all the graphs (or all triangle-free graphs) with minimum degree at least two. Chang and Zhu [3] gave the minimum value of the harmonic index for the graphs with minimum degree at least two and obtained a lower bound on the harmonic index of a triangle-free graph with arbitrary minimum degree. Cheng and Wang [4] determined the graph which attains the minimum harmonic index of connected graphs with minimum degree at least three, and posed the following Conjecture 1.1.

**Conjecture 1.1.** [4] Let G be a graph with  $n \ge 4$  vertices and  $\delta(G) \ge k$ , where  $1 \le k \le \lfloor \frac{n}{2} \rfloor + 1$ . Then  $H(G) \ge H(K_{k,n-k}^*)$  with equality if and only if  $G \cong K_{k,n-k}^*$ .

Ali [1] gave some counterexamples to show that the Conjecture 1.1 is not always true. In this work, using the methods in [5,10], we prove that Conjecture 1.1 is true when  $k \le \frac{n}{2}$ , and give a counterexample to show that the conjecture is not correct when  $k = \frac{n}{2} + 1$  (n is even).

For an edge e = uv of a graph G with harmonic index H(G), its weight is defined to be  $\frac{2}{d(u)+d(v)}$ . The harmonic index of G is the sum of weights over all its edges.

**Lemma 1.2.** [12] *If* e *is an edge with maximal weight in* G*, then* H(G - e) < H(G)*.* 

Let G be a graph with  $n \ge 4$  vertices and  $\delta(G) \ge k$ . If  $\delta(G) > k$ , then by Lemma 1.2, the deletion of an edge with maximal weight yields a graph G' of minimal degree at least k such that H(G') < H(G). So we only need prove the Conjecture 1.1 is true for G with  $\delta(G) = k$ . We can modify the Conjecture 1.1 to obtain the following Conjecture 1.3.

**Conjecture 1.3.** Let  $G \in G(n,k)$ , where  $n \ge 4$ ,  $1 \le k \le \lfloor \frac{n}{2} \rfloor + 1$ . Then  $H(G) \ge H(K_{k,n-k}^*)$  with equality if and only if  $G \cong K_{k,n-k}^*$ .

## 2. Preliminaries

First, we will give some linear equalities and nonlinear inequalities which must be satisfied in any graph from the class G(n,k). Denote by  $n_i$  the number of vertices of degree i, and by  $x_{i,j}$  the number of edges joining the vertices of degrees i and j in G(n,k). The mathematical description of the problem P to determining minimum of  $H(G) = \sum_{k \le i \le j \le n-1} \frac{2x_{i,j}}{i+j}$  is:

$$\min \sum_{k \le i \le j \le n-1} \frac{2x_{i,j}}{i+j}$$

subject to:

$$2x_{k,k} + x_{k,k+1} + x_{k,k+2} + \dots + x_{k,n-1} = kn_k,$$

$$x_{k,n-1} + x_{k+1,n-1} + x_{k+2,n-1} + \cdots + 2x_{n-1,n-1} = (n-1)n_{n-1},$$

$$n_k + n_{k+1} + n_{k+2} + \dots + n_{n-1} = n,$$
 (2)

$$x_{i,j} \le n_i n_j$$
, for  $k \le i \le n - 1$ ,  $i < j \le n - 1$ , (3)

$$x_{i,i} \le \binom{n_i}{2}$$
, for  $k \le i \le n-1$ , (4)

$$x_{i,j}, n_i$$
 are nonnegative integers, for  $k \le i \le j \le n-1$ . (5)

Constraints (1) - (5) define a nonlinearly optimization problem.

If the first equality from (1) divide by k, second by k + 1, third by k + 2 and so on, the last by n - 1 and sum them all, we get

$$\sum_{k < i < i < n-1} \left( \frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} \right) x_{i,j} = n_k + n_{k+1} + n_{k+2} + \dots + n_{n-1} = n$$

because of (2). Then

$$H(G) = \sum_{k \le i \le j \le n-1} \frac{2x_{i,j}}{i+j} = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{k \le i \le j \le n-1} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} + \frac{4}{i+j} - \frac{1}{i} - \frac{1}{j}\right) x_{i,j}$$

$$= \frac{1}{2} \sum_{k \le i \le j \le n-1} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j}\right) x_{i,j} - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{k \le i \le j \le n-1} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}\right) x_{i,j}$$

$$= \frac{n}{2} - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{k \le i \le j \le n-1} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}\right) x_{i,j} = \frac{n}{2} - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{k \le i \le j \le n-1} \frac{(i-j)^2}{ij(i+j)} x_{i,j}$$

$$= \frac{n}{2} - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{k \le i \le j \le n-1} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}\right) x_{i,j}.$$

Define

$$\gamma = \sum_{k \le i < j \le n-1} \left( \frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j} \right) x_{i,j}.$$

Henceforth we will consider the problem of maximizing  $\gamma$  instead of minimizing H(G).

### 3. Main result

**Theorem 3.1.** Let  $G \in G(n,k)$ , where  $n \geq 4$ ,  $1 \leq k \leq \frac{n}{2}$ . Then  $H(G) \geq H(K_{k,n-k}^*)$  with equality if and only if  $G \cong K_{k,n-k}^*$ .

Proof. Since the minimum degree of G is k, it is obvious that  $n_{n-1} \le k$ . Let m be the index such that  $n_m + n_{m+1} + \cdots + n_{n-2} + n_{n-1} \ge k$  and  $n_{m+1} + \cdots + n_{n-2} + n_{n-1} < k$ . We distinguish two cases: (1)  $n_m + \cdots + n_{n-2} + n_{n-1} = k$ , (2)  $n_m + \cdots + n_{n-2} + n_{n-1} > k$ .

Case 1.  $n_m + \cdots + n_{n-2} + n_{n-1} = k$ .

Note that

$$\gamma = \sum_{k \le i < j \le n-1} \left( \frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j} \right) x_{i,j} = \sum_{j=k+1}^{n-1} \left( \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{k+j} \right) x_{k,j} + \sum_{j=k+2}^{n-1} \left( \frac{1}{k+1} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{k+1+j} \right) x_{k+1,j} + \cdots + \sum_{j=m}^{n-1} \left( \frac{1}{m-1} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{m-1+j} \right) x_{m-1,j} + \sum_{m \le i < j \le n-1} \left( \frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j} \right) x_{i,j}.$$

Weights of all edges which join vertices of degree i, with vertices of degree j,  $i+1 \le j \le n-1$  are represented by  $\sum_{j=i+1}^{n-1}(\frac{1}{i}+\frac{1}{j}-\frac{4}{i+j})x_{i,j}$ . We give the maximum possible weights to these edges. Since  $n_m+\dots+n_{n-2}+n_{n-1}=k$  and  $\sum_{j=i+1}^{n-1}x_{i,j}\le in_i$ , first we join a vertex of degree i to all k vertices of degrees  $n-1,\dots,m$  (maximum weights) and with i-k vertices of other degrees j,  $i+1\le j\le m-1$ . Furthermore,  $h(x,y)=\frac{1}{x}+\frac{1}{y}-\frac{4}{x+y}$  is increasing for y, where  $k\le x< y\le m-1$  (since  $\frac{\partial h(x,y)}{\partial y}=\frac{(y-x)(3y+x)}{y^2(x+y)^2}>0$  for  $k\le x< y\le m-1$ ). We will

maximize the weights of these last i - k edges joining a vertex of degree i to i - k vertices of degree m - 1. Thus,

$$\sum_{j=i+1}^{n-1} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}\right) x_{i,j}$$

$$= \sum_{j=m}^{n-1} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}\right) x_{i,j} + \sum_{j=i+1}^{m-1} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}\right) x_{i,j}$$

$$\leq \sum_{j=m}^{n-1} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}\right) n_i n_j + \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{m-1} - \frac{4}{i+m-1}\right) (i-k) n_i$$

$$= n_i \left(\sum_{j=m}^{n-1} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}\right) n_j + \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{m-1} - \frac{4}{i+m-1}\right) (i-k)\right).$$

Then

$$\begin{split} \gamma &\leq n_k \bigg( \bigg( \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{k+n-1} \bigg) n_{n-1} + \bigg( \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{n-2} - \frac{4}{k+n-2} \bigg) n_{n-2} + \dots + \bigg( \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{m} - \frac{4}{k+m} \bigg) n_m \bigg) \\ &+ n_{k+1} \bigg( \bigg( \frac{1}{k+1} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{k+n} \bigg) n_{n-1} + \bigg( \frac{1}{k+1} + \frac{1}{n-2} - \frac{4}{k+n-1} \bigg) n_{n-2} + \dots \\ &+ \bigg( \frac{1}{k+1} + \frac{1}{m} - \frac{4}{k+1+m} \bigg) n_m + \bigg( \frac{1}{k+1} + \frac{1}{m-1} - \frac{4}{k+m} \bigg) \bigg) + \dots \\ &+ n_{m-1} \bigg( \bigg( \frac{1}{m-1} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{m+n-2} \bigg) n_{n-1} + \bigg( \frac{1}{m-1} + \frac{1}{n-2} - \frac{4}{m+n-3} \bigg) n_{n-2} + \dots \\ &+ \bigg( \frac{1}{m-1} + \frac{1}{m} - \frac{4}{2m-1} \bigg) n_m + \bigg( \frac{1}{m-1} + \frac{1}{m-1} - \frac{4}{2m-2} \bigg) (m-1-k) \bigg) \\ &+ \sum_{m \leq i < j \leq n-1} \bigg( \frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j} \bigg) x_{i,j} \\ &= \sum_{k \leq i \leq m-1} f(i) n_i + \sum_{m \leq i < j \leq n-1} \bigg( \frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j} \bigg) x_{i,j} \\ &= \gamma_1 + \gamma_2 \end{split}$$

where  $f(i) = \sum_{j=m}^{n-1} (\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}) n_j + (\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{m-1} - \frac{4}{i+m-1}) (i-k)$ . Let  $g(x) = x(\frac{1}{x} + \frac{1}{y} - \frac{4}{x+y})$ , where 0 < x < y. Note that  $g'(x) = \frac{(x-y)(x+3y)}{y(x+y)^2} < 0$  for 0 < x < y, then g(x) is monotonous decreasing for 0 < x < y. Thus we have for  $k+1 \le i \le m-1$ ,  $m \le j \le n-1$ :

$$k\left(\frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{k+j}\right) \ge i\left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}\right).$$

Therefore

$$f(i) \leq \frac{k}{i} \left( \sum_{j=m}^{n-1} \left( \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{k+j} \right) n_j + \left( \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{m-1} - \frac{4}{k+m-1} \right) (i-k) \right)$$

$$= \left( 1 - \frac{i-k}{i} \right) \left( \sum_{j=m}^{n-1} \left( \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{k+j} \right) n_j \right) + \frac{k(i-k)}{i} \left( \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{m-1} - \frac{4}{k+m-1} \right)$$

$$= \sum_{j=m}^{n-1} \left( \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{k+j} \right) n_j + \frac{i-k}{i} \left( \left( \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{m-1} - \frac{4}{k+m-1} \right) k - \sum_{j=m}^{n-1} \left( \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{k+j} \right) n_j \right)$$

$$\leq \sum_{j=m}^{n-1} \left( \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{k+j} \right) n_j,$$

because  $\sum_{j=m}^{n-1} n_j = k$  and  $m \le j \le n-1$ . Since  $n_k + \cdots + n_{m-1} = n-k$ , we have

$$\gamma_{1} = \sum_{k \leq i \leq m-1} f(i)n_{i} \leq \left(\sum_{j=m}^{n-1} \left(\frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{k+j}\right)n_{j}\right) \sum_{i=k}^{m-1} n_{i}$$

$$= (n-k) \sum_{j=m}^{n-1} \left(\frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{k+j}\right)n_{j} = \sum_{j=m}^{n-1} \left(\frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{k+n-1}\right)(n-k)n_{j}$$

$$- \sum_{j=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{k+n-1}\right)(n-k)n_{j} + \sum_{j=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{k+j}\right)(n-k)n_{j}$$

$$= \left(\frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{k+n-1}\right)(n-k)k - \sum_{i=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{n-1} + \frac{4}{k+j} - \frac{4}{k+n-1} - \frac{1}{j}\right)(n-k)n_{j}.$$

Since  $x_{i,j} \le n_i n_j$ ,  $m \le i < j \le n-1$ , and  $n_{n-1} = k - \sum_{j=m}^{n-2} n_j$ , we have

$$\begin{split} \gamma_2 &= \sum_{m \leq i < j \leq n-1} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}\right) x_{i,j} \leq \sum_{m \leq i < j \leq n-1} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}\right) n_i n_j \\ &= \sum_{i=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{i+n-1}\right) n_i \left(k - \sum_{j=m}^{n-2} n_j\right) + \sum_{m \leq i < j \leq n-2} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}\right) n_i n_j \\ &= k \sum_{i=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{i+n-1}\right) n_i - \sum_{i=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{i+n-1}\right) n_i^2 \\ &+ \sum_{m \leq i < j \leq n-2} \left(\left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{j} - \frac{4}{i+j}\right) - \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{i+n-1}\right) - \left(\frac{1}{j} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{j+n-1}\right) \right) n_i n_j \\ &= k \sum_{i=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{i+n-1}\right) n_i - \sum_{i=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{i+n-1}\right) n_i^2 \\ &- 2 \sum_{m \leq i \leq i \leq n-2} \left(\frac{2}{i+j} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{2}{i+n-1} - \frac{2}{j+n-1}\right) n_i n_j. \end{split}$$

Thus,

$$\begin{split} \gamma \leq & \gamma_1 + \gamma_2 \leq \left(\frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{k+n-1}\right) (n-k)k - \sum_{i=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{n-1} + \frac{4}{k+i} - \frac{4}{k+n-1} - \frac{1}{i}\right) (n-k)n_i \\ & + k \sum_{i=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{i+n-1}\right) n_i - \sum_{i=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{i+n-1}\right) n_i^2 \\ & - 2 \sum_{m \leq i < j \leq n-2} \left(\frac{2}{i+j} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{2}{i+n-1} - \frac{2}{j+n-1}\right) n_i n_j \\ & = \left(\frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{k+n-1}\right) (n-k)k - \sum_{i=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{i+n-1}\right) n_i^2 \\ & - 2 \sum_{m \leq i < j \leq n-2} \left(\frac{2}{i+j} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{2}{i+n-1}\right) k - \left(\frac{1}{n-1} + \frac{4}{k+i} - \frac{4}{k+n-1} - \frac{1}{i}\right) (n-k) n_i \\ & \leq \left(\frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{k+n-1}\right) (n-k)k - \sum_{i=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{i+n-1}\right) n_i^2 \\ & - 2 \sum_{m \leq i < j \leq n-2} \left(\frac{2}{i+j} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{2}{i+n-1} - \frac{2}{j+n-1}\right) n_i n_j \\ & + (n-k) \sum_{i=m}^{n-2} \left(\left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{i+n-1}\right) - \left(\frac{1}{n-1} + \frac{4}{k+i} - \frac{4}{k+n-1} - \frac{1}{i}\right) \right) n_i \\ & = \left(\frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{k+n-1}\right) (n-k)k - \left(\sum_{i=m}^{n-2} \left(\frac{1}{i} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{i+n-1}\right) n_i^2 \right) \\ & + 2 \sum_{m \leq i < j \leq n-2} \frac{(n-j-1)\left(2(n-1)(n+j-1) - (i+j)(n+i-1)\right)}{(i+j)(n-1)(n+i-1)(n+j-1)} n_i n_j \\ & + 2 \sum_{i=m} \frac{(n-j-1)\left(2(n-1)(n+j-1) - (i+j)(n+i-1)\right)}{(i+j)(n-1)(n+i-1)(n+j-1)} n_i n_i \\ & \leq \left(\frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{k+n-1}\right) (n-k)k. \end{split}$$

The second inequality holds because  $k \le n-k$ . So  $H(G) = \frac{n}{2} - \frac{\gamma}{2} \ge \frac{n}{2} - \frac{1}{2}(\frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{n-1} - \frac{4}{k+n-1})(n-k)k = \frac{k(k-1)}{2(n-1)} + \frac{2k(n-k)}{k+n-1} = H(K_{k,n-k}^*)$ . Equality holds when  $n_i = 0$  for  $k+1 \le i \le n-2$ ,  $n_k = n-k$ ,  $n_{n-1} = k$ ,  $x_{k,n-1} = (n-k)k$ ,  $x_{n-1,n-1} = \binom{k}{2}$ , and all other  $x_{i,j}$  are equal to zero. Thus, graphs for which the harmonic index attains its minimum value are  $K_{k,n-k}^*$ .

**Case 2**.  $n_m + \cdots + n_{n-2} + n_{n-1} > k$ .

We put  $n_m = n_{m'} + n_{m''}$ , such that  $n_{m''} + n_{m+1} + \dots + n_{n-1} = k$ . Then  $n_k + \dots + n_{m-1} + n_{m'} = n - k$ . We will color the vertices of degree m with red and white, such that the number of red vertices is  $n_{m''}$ . Denote by  $x_{i,m'}$  (resp.  $x_{i,m''}$ ) for  $i \neq m$ , the number of edges between vertices of degree i and the white (resp. red) vertices of degree m, by  $x_{m',m'}$  (resp.  $x_{m'',m''}$ ) the number of edges between white (resp. red) vertices of degree m, and by  $x_{m',m''}$  the number of edges between white and red vertices of degree m. Then  $x_{i,m} = x_{i,m'} + x_{i,m''}$  for

 $i \neq m$ , and  $x_{m,m} = x_{m',m'} + x_{m',m''} + x_{m'',m''}$ . We will replace system (1) by:

$$x_{k,i} + \dots + x_{i,m-1} + x_{i,m'} + x_{i,m''} + x_{i,m+1} + \dots + x_{i,n-1} = in_i, k \le i \le n-1, i \ne m,$$

$$x_{k,m'} + \dots + x_{m-1,m'} + 2x_{m',m'} + x_{m',m''} + x_{m',m+1} + \dots + x_{m',n-1} = mn_{m'},$$

$$x_{k,m''} + \dots + x_{m-1,m''} + x_{m',m''} + 2x_{m'',m''} + x_{m'',m+1} + \dots + x_{m'',n-1} = mn_{m''}.$$

$$(1')$$

We will proceed similarly as in the Case 1. The rest of the proof is omitted, because it is similar to the one of Case 1.  $\Box$ 

**Remark** When  $k = \frac{n}{2} + 1$ ,  $n \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$  and  $n \geq 8$ , we give a counterexample to show that the Conjecture 1.1 is not correct. Let G' be an n-vertex graph obtained from  $K_n$  by deleting the edges of an  $(\frac{n}{2} - 2)$ -regular graph on  $\frac{n}{2}$  vertices. Then  $G' \in G(n, \frac{n}{2} + 1)$ . By some elementary calculations, we have  $H(K^*_{\frac{n}{2}+1,\frac{n}{2}-1}) = \frac{n^2+2n}{8(n-1)} + \frac{n^2-4}{3n}$ ,  $H(G') = \frac{n^2-2n}{8(n-1)} + \frac{n}{2}$ . Thus,  $H(K^*_{\frac{n}{2}+1,\frac{n}{2}-1}) - H(G') = \frac{(n-4)^2}{6n(n-1)(n+2)} > 0$  for  $n \geq 8$ . This implies  $H(K^*_{\frac{n}{2}+1,\frac{n}{2}-1}) > H(G')$ .

When  $k = \lfloor \frac{n}{2} \rfloor + 1$ , n is odd, that is  $k = \frac{n+1}{2}$ , the graph  $G_1$  in [1] is a counterexample which can show that the Conjecture 1.1 is also not correct.

#### References

- [1] A. Ali, Counter examples to a conjecture concerning harmonic index, Asian-European J. Math. 11 (2018) 1850035 (3 pages) https://doi.org/10.1142/S1793557118500353.
- [2] J. A. Bondy, U. S. R. Murty, Graph Theory with Applications, Elsvier, New York, 1976.
- [3] R. Chang, Y. Zhu, On the harmonic index and the minimum degree of a graph, Rom. J. Inf. Sci. Tech. 15 (2012) 335-343.
- [4] M. Cheng, L. Wang, A lower bound for the harmonic index of a graph with minimum degree at least three, Filomat 30 (2016) 2249-2260.
- [5] T. Divnić, L. j. Pavlović, Proof of the first part of the conjecture of Aouchiche and Hansen about the Randić index, Discrete Appl. Math. 161 (2013) 953-960.
- [6] S. Fajtlowicz, On conjectures of Graffiti-II, Congr. Numer. 60 (1987) 187-197.
- [7] I. Gutman, B. Furtula (Eds.), Recent Results in the Theory of Randić Index, University of Kragujevac, Kragujevac, 2008.
- [8] X. Li, I. Gutman, Mathematical Aspects of Randić-Type Molecular Structure Descriptors, University of Kragujevac, Kragujevac, 2006.
- [9] X. Li, Y. Shi, A survey on the Randić index, MATCH Commun. Math. Comput. Chem. 59 (2008) 127-156.
- [10] M. Milivojević, L. j. Pavlović, The variation of the Randić index with regard to minimum and maximum degree, Discrete Appl. Math. 217 (2017) 286-293.
- [11] M. Randić, On characterization of molecular branching, J. Am. Chem. Soc. 97 (1975) 6609-6615.
- [12] R. Wu, Z. Tang, H. Deng, A lower bound for the harmonic index of a graph with minimum degree at least two, Filomat 27 (2013)
- [13] L. Zhong, The harmonic index for graphs, Appl. Math. Lett. 25 (2012) 561-566.